

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Yale Indian: The Education of Henry Roe Cloud. By Joel Pfister

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5w36q376>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kiel, Doug

Publication Date

2010

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

false dichotomy between those who went to war in 1862 and those who sided with whites. The current tribal interactions and issues are far more complex than she portrays. Instead she moves quickly to her view of what would constitute justice for the Dakota. She calls for the return of all “public lands,” which constitutes about 22 percent of the states’ land base, or about 11,836,375 acres. This would allow the tribe to return en masse to Minnesota and live according to their way of being. She notes the tremendous environmental benefits the state would gain by such a decision and discounts the feared loss of tax revenue. Although tax revenue may decline, she quite correctly notes that the state has grown rich off of the land it stole from the Dakota; therefore the bill has been paid. She argues that because of the brutal ways that the United States and Minnesota exterminated the Dakota and dispossessed them of their lands, they need to pay reparations. These reparations would be used to pay Dakota relocation expenses, create an infrastructure to provide for basic needs upon arrival, and provide professional training in resource management.

In her conclusion Waziyatawin continues her frank discussion by calling for the elimination of the US government and capitalism. Although it is not clear if she refers to their elimination only from Dakota culture or as entities in total, this contradicts earlier statements that whites faced no threats from the re-creation of a Dakota homeland in Minnesota. This may be technically true for the former, but in either case whites will perceive these statements as a threat. Nonetheless, Waziyatawin has produced a well-written and thoughtful book that sets the tone and level of discussion where it needs to be to achieve final justice in Indian country. It is also fitting that this book emphasizes education because it should be assigned to any and all high school and college classes that pertain to Native American studies. Reading and discussing this book can be the first step in creating the new social order Waziyatawin seeks. Unfortunately, the fruition of these Native aspirations may take decades, if not centuries, to be realized. African Americans still struggle to attain their cultural goals in America; it will be a longer process for Native Americans.

Jeff Means

University of Wyoming

The Yale Indian: The Education of Henry Roe Cloud. By Joel Pfister. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009. 280 pages. \$79.95 cloth; \$22.95 paper.

Henry Roe Cloud (1884–1950) is typically remembered as the first Indian to receive undergraduate and graduate degrees from Yale University, an advocate of Indian higher education, a founder of the Society of American Indians, and one of the ten authors of the influential Meriam Report of 1928 (*The Problem of Indian Administration*). Instead of constructing a traditional historical biography, Joel Pfister expands upon his earlier work in *Individuality Incorporated: Indians and the Multicultural Modern* (2004) by probing the themes of Roe Cloud’s psychological and emotional experience, formative personal

relationships, and changing political philosophies. This is a challenging task, for, unlike his contemporaries Charles Eastman, Carlos Montezuma, and *Zitkala-Ša* (Gertrude Simmons Bonnin), Roe Cloud wrote little in the way of autobiography. Nonetheless, *The Yale Indian* paints a detailed portrait of a complex and, at times, contradictory individual whose privileged education facilitated a career devoted to the betterment of Native people.

Pfister's study is organized in three parts, which treat Roe Cloud's Yale education, sentimental relationships, and professional life in Indian affairs. In part 1, Pfister highlights Roe Cloud's encounter with the "individualizing" agenda at Yale. Pfister compares this agenda to the mission of government-run boarding schools, which sought to transform Indians into "'individuals' who would yearn to work, own private property, accumulate wealth, and lead a sentimental family life" (xii). At Yale, Roe Cloud gained admission to an elite social class and received training "intended to groom him as a manager of men" (41). Roe Cloud would use this training to aid Indians who lacked the opportunities that he enjoyed.

As a student, Roe Cloud displayed intellectual curiosity and a tireless work ethic. His experiences at government-run Indian schools, the Mount Hermon School (a private college preparatory school in Massachusetts), and Yale—in addition to Samuel Smiles's popular book *Self-Help* (1859)—instilled in Roe Cloud the notion that success or failure resided in the individual, not in the system. He excelled in a range of academic subjects and was inducted into Yale's elite Elihu Club. Because he was the only Indian at Yale, and perhaps in New Haven as well, it is perhaps an understatement to say that "Roe Cloud was outnumbered, always outnumbered, by whites and by stereotypes" (69). Though Pfister claims Roe Cloud was somewhat critical of the university in his later years, he continued to pride himself on his affiliation with Yale.

In part 2, Pfister turns his attention to Henry Roe Cloud's relationship with Mary Wickham Roe, an upper-middle-class white missionary who did evangelical work in the Oklahoma Territory with her husband, Dr. Walter Clark Roe. After attending a lecture Mary gave at Yale during the autumn of 1906, Henry began spending his summers working with the Roes: when the couple informally adopted him, he changed his middle name from Clarence to Roe. For Mary Roe, whose only child died in infancy in 1889, Roe Cloud seems to have satisfied what Pfister calls "her suppressed maternal drive" (101). Their correspondence shows them developing "a deep, cross-culturally complex, highly sentimentalized, melodramatic affection for one another" (13). Roe Cloud, whose parents died in 1896 and 1897, would call Mary Roe his mother for the rest of his life.

Pfister characterizes their relationship as a deep friendship expressed in familial language and Winnebago terms of endearment. For the young Roe Cloud, faced with the challenges of Yale and without his parents and extended family, the Roes filled an important emotional void, while providing the social and financial support that only individuals of their standing could offer. As time went on, Mary sought more of his attention (while Dr. Roe hardly mentioned him in his diaries). She often interfered in Henry's romantic relationships, discouraging him from marrying too soon and jeopardizing his

intellectual and professional development. According to Pfister, Mary sought to impose some white Protestant restraint on what she regarded as Henry's primitive Winnebago instincts. Roe Cloud eventually married Elizabeth Bender, a Bad River Ojibwe from Wisconsin, who sought Mary's acceptance but never gained it. Mary continued to be overly protective and possessive. Despite his subtle attempts to assert his independence from her, Roe Cloud always acknowledged that it was Mary who inspired his lifelong commitment to Indian affairs. In her eyes—and in Pfister's—Henry Roe Cloud was the W. E. B. Du Bois of the Indians.

In part 3 of *The Yale Indian*, Pfister analyzes the arc of Roe Cloud's activist career. He chose to apply his elite education to the pursuit of collective reform rather than personal wealth. As Pfister notes, he “did not manage factories or become a partner in a wealthy law firm, as did many of his classmates” (73). Rather, he served as a founder of the American Indian Institute (a private college preparatory school), the head of the Haskell Institute (a government boarding school), a Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) administrator, and a superintendent of the federal government's Umatilla Agency in Oregon. Though he served as an administrator of an Indian boarding school, he was critical of that system's vocational emphasis and militaristic regimen. He maintained that Indian college students “had to *overcome* the ill effects of government boarding schools” in order to be successful (3, emphasis in original).

As a white-collar activist—often viewed by whites as a model Indian who was qualified to speak on behalf of all Native people—Roe Cloud had to master racial and class dynamics in order to gain support for his program of improving Indian welfare through education. Like many Indians of his social standing, he did not suppress his Winnebago identity but chose the terms in which he was willing to express it. For example, in a 1909 issue of the *Yale Courant* he questioned the value of the “weird chants” and “mad whirl” of tribal dances (72).

Roe Cloud felt Indian assimilation to be inevitable; nevertheless, he found it imperative to incorporate Native ways of thinking and living into mainstream society. A proto-multiculturalist, according to Pfister, he supported the teaching of traditional culture in Indian schools before BIA Commissioner John Collier and his New Deal-era policies embraced multiculturalism. Surprisingly, Roe Cloud and Collier had friction with one another. As Pfister explains, they feigned respect for one another at one moment only to criticize one another in the next. Collier went so far as to question his colleague's intelligence. Pfister notes that “Roe Cloud's presence complicated Collier's romantic construct of Indianness” (142). However, “Collier knew that Roe Cloud conferred both authenticity and distinction on his Indian Reorganization Act campaign” (144). In Pfister's view, Collier felt threatened by Roe Cloud and perhaps even saw him as a rival.

The Yale Indian makes an important contribution to the study of American Indian education and activism in the early twentieth century by demonstrating the complicated ways in which elite Indians used class privilege and access to power in order to further the Native cause. As Pfister concludes, “if at times Henry explored the white road, it was in the service of opening new

Indian roads" (123). The lives of Henry Roe Cloud and his reform-minded contemporaries cannot be adequately explained through the mere pursuit of social and economic mobility. But Pfister's overarching claim that "Roe Cloud, before becoming the Yale Indian, was and remained the Winnebago Indian" requires a fuller examination of his childhood in Nebraska during the turbulent—and individualizing—land allotment years, when he also first encountered Christianity (9). Pfister acknowledges the autobiographical silence in Roe Cloud's writings, which reveal few details of his Winnebago upbringing. Pfister sketches how "Roe Cloud viewed adoption at least in part through a Winnebago lens," but providing an enhanced Winnebago perspective through deeper ethnohistorical investigation could add further layers of meaning to the complex relationship between Henry Roe Cloud and Mary Roe (89). Furthermore, how Roe Cloud worked his way from government-run Indian schools to the prestigious Mount Herman School to Yale is a story that would have been germane to the present volume—as would a fuller exploration of Roe Cloud's postgraduate study at Oberlin and the Auburn Theological Seminary, and his identity as a Presbyterian minister. To be sure, Pfister's account of Roe Cloud's education is centered on his years at Yale, yet these earlier and later phases of his education could further shed light on how Henry Roe Cloud was individualized and socialized, which are some of Pfister's primary concerns.

Despite the limitations imposed by its thematic focus, Joel Pfister's *The Yale Indian* is a thought-provoking and refreshingly original profile of the inner experience of one of the twentieth century's most influential Native leaders, a figure whom surprisingly few have written about. Scholars of American history, culture, politics, education, and indigenous studies will surely find this an engaging text and an innovative approach to American Indian biography that brings emotional and psychological experiences to the fore.

Doug Kiel

University of Wisconsin–Madison

Zamumo's Gifts: Indian-European Exchange in the Colonial Southeast. By Joseph M. Hall Jr. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009. 248 pages. \$37.50 cloth.

Zamumo was the *mico* of Altamaha when in 1540 he met Hernando de Soto in what is today the Oconee Valley of central Georgia. In return for the baskets of maize and haunches of venison de Soto received upon his arrival, he presented Zamumo with a silver feather that completed the creation of a reciprocal relationship made possible by the original offer of food. Gift giving, not trade, brought the knight of Spain and the sun of Altamaha together on that day, and, for the South's first peoples, their encounter began the transition to a colonial world of colonization, commercial trading, and imperial war. But as Joseph M. Hall Jr. argues, the encounter between Zamumo and de Soto signaled no abrupt extension of capitalism into the Native South.