

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Cultural Convergence in New Mexico: Interactions in Art, History & Archaeology—Honoring William Wroth. Edited by Robin Farwell Gavin and Donna Pierce.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7p27q6hb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 45(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bernstein, Bruce

Publication Date

2021-06-01

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Cultural Convergence in New Mexico: Interactions in Art, History & Archaeology—Honoring William Wroth. Edited by Robin Farwell Gavin and Donna Pierce. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2021. 307 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

William Wroth (1942–2019) assembled this lavishly illustrated volume of interdisciplinary essayists before his death, selecting contributors with whom he had worked and whose work he found engaging. Working with him and serving as editors were two long-time colleagues, Donna Pierce and Robin Farwell Gavin, who completed the volume. Like Wroth's own interests, the contributions are eclectic with most arising out of his primary research and publication area of the Hispano Southwest. Some of the book's essayists and topics are well known and others more regional, providing readers with a balance of local concerns and broader research topics. The book includes an interesting mix of university and community scholars, demonstrating the need for the continued broadening and diversification of our fields of study. All of the contributions represent current research adding to the larger goal of understanding the American Southwest broadly, as well as in geographically specific ways. There is no other current volume that melds together Indigenous and Hispanic cultures over such a broad swath of time, other than Wroth's edited volume with Robin Farwell Gavin, *Converging Streams: Art of the Hispanic and Native American Southwest* (2010).

This volume's four parts are titled "Spanish and American Interaction"; "Art, History, and Culture of New Spain"; and "Modern Expressions and Politics." Part 4, "The Life of Will Wroth," offers some details of William Wroth's life, a list of published works and selected exhibitions, and a chapter on his poetry by John Brandi. The essays are comprehensive, representing well-reasoned scholarly writing. Some present wholly new research and information, while others take a more political orientation. As an added dimension, most are wonderfully color-illustrated, creating expansive vignettes much like museum exhibitions. Readers will appreciate the volume's many meticulous citations and comments in the extensive footnotes. The book might serve as an introduction to the American Southwest for some and for others, a refresher of the compelling nature of the region's past and present, culturally, historically, and artistically. As Wroth posits the book's purpose, "While [the essays] all deal with questions of New Mexico history and culture they reflect larger concerns that I believe are of vital importance in our world today: how can people of different cultures and histories living in close proximity coexist in harmony and productively interact with one another to lead meaningful, enriching lives?" (11)

Following this dictum, the writers engage with seeking to locate the impact of interaction between Spanish and Indigenous cultures, with success in highlighting convergences as well as cultural tensions. It is out of these tensions, after all, that conversation and growth come. Part One is largely archaeological, written by archaeologists and an art historian and linguist. Richard Ford explores the introduction of new farming methods and crops and husbandry for colonists and Indigenous populations. He writes from his half-century of collaborative archaeological, historical and ethnographic perspective. Art historian Klinton Burgio-Ericson discusses how Indigenous iconography and geography are overlaid

by the Spanish Catholic church, while archaeologist Scott Ortman and linguist David Shaul explore how patterns of Native linguistic change can shed some light on the process of Indigenous willful incorporation of elements of the Spanish colonial world. Burgio-Ericson's heavily illustrated chapter helps bring readers to a more nuanced and deeper appreciation.

Part 2, "Art, History, and Culture of New Spain," is the longest section with ten contributions primarily based on artifactual research data including wills, papers, wooden storage chests, and houses. Other essays address trade, secularization, community history, devotion, community celebration, and a much-revered pilgrimage site, the Santuario de Chimayo. The essays are: "Devotion to La Virgen de Guadalupe in Seventeenth Century New Mexico" (Jose Antonio Esquibel); "Devotional Geographies and Imagined Communities" (Christina Cruz Gonzalez); "The Catholic Church in Late Spanish Colonial New Mexico" (Rick Henricks); "Tomas Velez Cachupin, or How Many Montanese Does It Take to Change a Colony" (John L. Kessel); "The Santuario de Chimayo in Tewa Pueblo History" (William Wroth); "The Bernardo Abeyta House in Chimayo" (Victor Dan Jaramillo); "Saving the Ortega Papers and Two Hundred Years of Chimayo History" (Don Unser); "Trails, Trade and the Transformation of Traditional Art in Spanish New Mexico" (Robin Farwell Gavin); "The Estate Inventory of Antonia Duran De Armijo or Taos" (Donna Pierce); and "Colonial New Mexico Chests" (Lane Coulter). When read individually or as a whole, these essays provide historical and cultural contextual information about Hispano colonization and its continuing legacies today. Unfortunately, this section falls short of Wroth and the editors' goal of a balance of Indigenous and Hispano topics because there is no essay on Indigenous culture and art, which gives the misleading impression of the disappearance or submission of Pueblo people to Spanish colonizers.

The third part includes four essays contributed by Jonathan Batkin, Enrique R. Lamadrid, and photography by Miguel A. Gandert, Orlando Romero, and Jack Loeffler. Batkin's finely researched article provides information about the production of a set of pseudo-ceremonial objects sold by tribal members to Santa Fe collectors. Lamadrid and Gandert's text and photo essay is a journey into the ritual, choreography, and costume of public and private ceremonies from Mexico to New Mexico of Native and Mestizo populations that dramatize their political and cultural struggles. Romero addresses the questions of racial purity and racism through a discussion of Hispano ideals of "purity of blood." Loeffler explores the existential self and humans' place within a greater and natural world through self-reflection and excerpts from a lifetime of interviews, with Santa Clara Pueblo scholar Rina Swentzell, Hopi archaeologist Lyle Balenquah, and Tohono O'odham philosopher Camillus Lopez.

Given Wroth's object-oriented scholarship, it is no surprise that object-centric essays dominate. With broad use of illustrations and varieties of scholarly points of view, the book will add a dimensionality to staid scholarly work. The complexities of colonization by Spanish and American populations are enormous, very much still part of the daily life and culture of the Southwest. No book can adequately address all

concerns or topics, but rather, through good scholarship, can point to a more nuanced and humanistic manner to inclusive and compelling narratives.

Early in his career, Wroth took a zig-zagging path through Central America and Mexico, eventually moving to northern New Mexico in 1970, where for a half-century he pursued life as an independent scholar. He had a brief sojourn as curator at the Colorado Springs Fine Arts Center and Taylor Museum, where he was to further absorb himself in historic Hispanic and Indigenous arts. He authored or edited a dozen seminal books and another two dozen articles. He was always an active and generous researcher, ready to converse about recent topics of interest, share his vast knowledge of the literature and network of collaborators, and offer observations from a life of doing. Over the years, it was a common occurrence to see Will and his wife Deborah at many Pueblo dances.

Bruce Bernstein

Coe Center for the Arts

Decolonizing “Prehistory”: Deep Time and Indigenous Knowledges in North America. Edited by Gesa Mackenthun and Christen Mucher. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2021. 288 pages. \$60.00 cloth; \$35.00 paper.

North and South American Indians have long been written off as primitives without government, religion, and history. Providing balanced assessment of the place of marginalized peoples and societies within the historical record has long been a goal of scholarship, and especially of the peoples themselves. Generations of failures to do this, both deliberate and accidental, have had monumental consequences for those often deemed “without history.” American Indians are among those victimized by histories that relegate them to the fringes as people who sat around waiting for Europeans to arrive and create history for them. It all hinged on the notion that only those who wrote had history and not those who used memory passed on orally to explain and guide their lives. Of course, because Indigenous histories were framed differently from those of colonial societies does not mean that they do not exist. Relegating American Indians to historical non-actors made it easier for imperialist Europeans to justify taking their land, pursue cultural genocide, and develop the idea of American/European right to rule. It has made it difficult for American Indians to assert their continuing societies against an irresistible force of colonial government in the present.

Indigenous knowledge can be tapped by multidisciplinary techniques to tease out histories in a way credible to the present. Some call this mining of traditional knowledge “deep time” decolonizing of history. In any case, it is no longer acceptable to characterize the millennia before Europeans arrived in America as “prehistory.” Mainstream scholars from many disciplines have accepted generally that they need to rectify earlier errors, but it is an uphill struggle requiring a new body of scholarship to provide a picture that includes vibrant, decisive, consequential societies which are